# "Michelle Obama is a man" Problematizing Authority in Today's Post-Truth Post-Trust World

Carol A. Leibiger
Alan W. Aldrich
University of South Dakota

## Declaration

I would like to begin by acknowledging that the land on which we gather is Treaty 4 and 6 territory and the traditional territory of the Cree and Saulteaux, Assiniboine, and Métis.

I am a US-American from South Dakota, part of the traditional lands of the Lakota, Nakota, and Dakota peoples.

I pay respect to these communities and their Elders past, present and emerging.

## Fake news: Michelle Obama





News Voices Sports Culture Indy/Life Video Daily Edition



# People are social.



- People...
  - affiliate with groups.
  - hold membership in multiple groups.
  - value their group memberships.
- Groups serve important instrumental and relational functions.

- Groups...
  - co-construct knowledge.
  - recognize different kinds of authority.
  - invest authorities with power.
- Self-identity is created and sustained in part through our groups.

## Group knowledge





Group knowledge parallels and can compete with larger societal (superordinate) discourses or narratives.

- "America as a melting pot"
- "Hard work leads to success"
- "Equal opportunity for everyone"
- "March of progress"
- "American exceptionalism"

# Current shift to heterogeneity



- Mainstream media used to be seen as the voice of the superordinate group.
  - There were fewer media sources (old media with old-media ethics).
  - They covered higher-status/elite group news.
  - They ignored/minimally covered lower-status group news.
- Competing groups are claiming recognition and authority.
- Like society, media is reconstituting itself.









# Heterogeneity, groups, and new media



- Like society, media is becoming more fragmented or aligned with different groups of consumers and their group knowledge/beliefs.
  - Social media
  - Nonprofessional media, i.e. blogs, wikis, etc.
- New media don't necessarily subscribe to old media standards.
  - Ethical standards
  - "Alternative facts" vs. "facts"
  - Group orientation vs. mainstream orientation



# Academic knowledge/expertise



- Academics are now one group among many.
- Academic knowledge/discourse no longer enjoys its earlier prestige.
- Since academic knowledge is no longer privileged, it is not surprising that students reject it.
  - They don't identify as members of the academy.
  - They don't discriminate between knowledge and beliefs.
  - They privilege their group opinions.



# Information literacy instruction



- Information-literacy instruction seeks to teach students...
  - how to navigate and evaluate information and sources
  - for academic, professional, and personal purposes.
- The Framework for Information Literacy for Higher Education (2016) can inform information-literacy instruction.
- The Authority frame...
  - states that contexts and notions of authority differ
  - recognizes the legitimacy of personal or group beliefs within appropriate contexts.

# Authority and context



If information-literacy instruction serves academic, professional, and personal needs, people need to be taught to distinguish...

- different kinds of authority
- within/across differing contexts and groups, i.e.
  - academic or professional communities,
  - media or consumer groups,
  - familial groups,
  - ethnic groups,
  - religious groups, and
  - political groups.



## Fake news



- Fake news is often a response to superordinate /establishment group beliefs and knowledge.
- Group beliefs, knowledge, and authority are validated, helping to create and sustain group affinity.
- Relationships have primacy over facts/knowledge when they are in conflict.
  - When a group perceives itself as endangered, members pull together.
  - Members cling more tightly to their group belief system, resisting outside influences that conflict with their beliefs.
  - Groups use social (new) media to reinforce their beliefs.
- Fake news can be wielded with good or bad intent.

## Fake news: Survivors as "crisis actors"





# **Problematizing Authority**



#### The Authority frame...

- represents standards of academic research (credentials)
- is situated in academic notions of truth and reason.
- cannot adequately address nonacademic information sources.

- The Authority frame's dispositions call for...
  - (self-)recognition of bias
  - development of an open mind, selfawareness, and self-evaluation.
- There is no recognition of the importance of motive.

## On motive



People fulfill goals by creating and disseminating information.
 Information can influence as well as inform.

 Examining motive reveals underlying reasons, both relational and instrumental, for message creation and design, as well as the ways in which the information is received and used.

 Motive is not particular to the sender or receiver.

 Understanding motive requires examining the motives of all participants.



## **Examining motive**



#### Sender motives:

- Why provide the information?
- What group is the message targeting?
- What is the purpose of the message design (logos)?
- What is the emotional appeal of the message (pathos)?

#### Receiver motives:

- What is the information need?
- Why was this specific content chosen (logos)?
- How does the message make the receiver feel (pathos)?
- To which of the receiver's group memberships is the message salient?

## Fake news and motive



- Fake news often appeals to basic emotions and beliefs.
- People often fail to examine beliefs or deal with them critically or logically.
- Emotions and beliefs can be exploited by fake news.
- Exploitation of emotions and beliefs can be better understood by examining speakers' and receivers' motives.



#### YourNewsWire.com

News. Truth. Unfiltered.





The CNN head office in Atlanta, Georgia, was raided by Federal Communications Commission (FCC) agents
Tuesday in an operation related to the "violation of press guidelines" including "publishing and promotion of
blatantly false information designed to deceive the American public," according to reports.

The FCC arrived unannounced and seized documents and hard drives as part of their investigation, including all of the "source data" the network has used for their stories.

MSNBC and the Associated Press are also reported to have been raided by the FCC for violating press guidelines, including the "printing of blatant lies", the "publishing and promotion of stories which require immediate retractions while not promoting the retractions", according to a source within one of networks.

According to the FCC, "Broadcasters may not intentionally distort the news." It is understood that CNN, MSNBC and the AP are under investigation for breaking FCC rules. The FCC states that "rigging or slanting the news is a most heinous act against the public interest."

# Proposed revision to the Authority frame



#### Add one disposition:

examine the possible motives of both the message creator and message receiver.

- This one recommendation allows the framework to be generally applicable and not prescriptive.
- The Authority dispositions are strengthened through inclusion of motive.

Other aspects of the framework will also be strengthened.

- Information Creation as a Process
  - Help to better understand purpose of the message being conveyed and its delivery method
  - Help to better understand the role of the other's context/situation/ group
- Research as Conversation
  - Help to better critically evaluate the contributions made by others (Research as Conversation)

# Thank you!



Carol A. Leibiger
Associate Professor, Information Literacy Coordinator c.leibiger@usd.edu

Alan W. Aldrich
Associate Professor, Instructional Services Librarian alan.aldrich@usd.edu

# Mainstream society and old media



- Mainstream (superordinate) society was previously perceived and treated as being much more homogeneous than today.
- Academic credentials were proof of expertise and authority.
- There were fewer media sources (old media with old-media ethics).
- These media sources covered higher-status or elite group news.
- Lower-status groups were ignored or given minimal coverage or attention.